



QIA Professionalising the Workforce Case studies

Overview 10 PTLIS case studies Report Summary

Acknowledgments

Many people have supported this research project and their contributions are gratefully acknowledged.

The case study research team:

Jill Hardman

Susie Knight

Vron Leslie

Bob Payne

Ron Turford

Special thanks are due to all of the organisations that took part and the interviewees who gave their time so generously.

Director WMCETT, Dr Fergus McKay

Report was edited by Jill Hardman
June 2008

Overview Report Summary

Introduction

This short summary is drawn from the main overview report which draws together key points emerging from the summaries and conclusions in each of 10 individual case study reports. The 10 case studies themselves are appended to the overview. Each comprises a separate report with primary data attached.

The purpose of the project is to learn lessons about the impact and experience of the new qualification framework. It is specifically focused on the new “threshold award” – Preparing to Teach in the Lifelong Learning Sector (PTLLS).

Each of the 10 case studies is focussed on a particular presentation of a PTLLS programme between 2007 -2008. The sample of 10 courses was selected to reflect the range of programmes that have been developed for different contexts around the same common themes and the diversity of the participants who attended them.

The aims of the study are:

- To evaluate the introduction of PTLLS for WMCETT
- To produce case studies for the QIA Professionalising the Workforce case study project.

The project began as an evaluation of the PTLLS programmes which were originally designed and developed by the University of Warwick and then further developed to address the needs of the West Midlands Centre for Excellence in Teacher Training [WMCETT] and its priority areas.

The case study findings are in addition, presented to support the QIA Professionalising the Workforce Project which aims to

- clarify the impact of the new workforce reforms on Initial Teacher Education/Training (ITE/ITT) and Continuing Professional Development (CPD) provision,
- inform and identify key priorities for development in relation to
 - QIA’s National Improvement Strategy,
 - LLUK’s Workforce Development Strategy
 - IfL’s Professional Development Strategy.

Case study methodology

The research was carried out using semi-structured interviews. Each case study focussed on a particular presentation of a PTLLS programme and it was selected to reflect the range of programmes that have been developed to suit different needs and contexts and the diversity of the participants who attended them.

Summary of PTLLS Overview report

The sample of respondents selected for each case study was made up as far as possible to include: 3 'trainees' (the term used for the programme participants), the teacher educator who delivered the programme and the sponsor or employer of one of the trainees interviewed.

In this way, each case study is made up as a 'cluster' of respondents. They share a common reference point which is the PTLLS programme in which they were all, in their various ways, involved.

The areas and questions explored in the case studies

The areas explored in the case studies include the following:

- The Views of Teacher Educators
in relation to:
 - Their experience of teacher training
 - Their experience of the PTLLS course
 - Their experience of planning and delivering PTLLS
 - The teaching observation
 - Assessment
 - Support for trainees
 - Course evaluation
 - Impact of the course
 - Progression intentions of the trainees
 - Marketing

- The Views of Sponsors
in relation to:
 - Professionalising the workforce
 - Understanding the Qualifications Framework
 - Experience of the PTLLS programme
 - Impact of the course
 - Support for staff
 - Future plans

- The Views of Trainees
in relation to:
 - Entry to the course
 - Initial assessment
 - Course structure and content
 - Programme delivery
 - Impact of the course
 - Future plans

The sample of programmes

Summary of PTLLS Overview report

The table below illustrates the range and variety of PTLLS programmes developed to meet the needs/levels of specific groups of students in particular settings.

Case study	Sector	Pattern of Delivery	Variation
1	Public Sector:	10 x Thu 5.00 – 7.00 13 x Thu 6.00 – 9.00	Tailored to Fire Service
2	WBL	10 x Wednesdays 4.00 – 6.30	14 - 16
3	FE	10 x Mon 6.00 - 9.00	
4	FE	7 x 4 hour days + tutorials	
5	WBL	10 x 3 hour half-days	Level 4 PTLLS + Literacy with work based observation
6	Vol	5 x 1 day 9.30 – 4.30	
7	FE	12 x Wednesdays 6.00 -9.00	Uni Warwick prog.
8	FE	12 x Wednesdays 6.15-9.30pm	C & G L3 PTLLS programme
9	WBL	2 x 2 day blocks + 1day tutorial	L3 PTLLS+ * Contextualised: WBL * includes workplace observation
10	WBL	2 days with gap + 2 days 20 th /21 st Nov.07 16 th /17 th Jan 08	With work based observation.

The trainees

In total 162 trainees attended these programmes and 147 trainees successfully completed the Award.

28 trainees were interviewed. They were widely diverse in terms of age, background and qualifications.

Range of qualifications held by trainees interviewed		
Up to and including L2	L3 – L4	L6 and above
4	12	12

The employers

Interviews were held with 11 employers or 'sponsors' (usually the trainee's manager).

	Sector	Role
1	Public	Training Centre Manager
2	WBL	Manager of small WBL organisation
3	Public	Training Manager
4	FE	College Director of 14 – 19 Partnerships
5	WBL	Manager of large WBL organisation
6	Vol	Organiser of small vol.org.
7	Private	Training Manager of small in-house private training provision
8		

Summary of PTLLS Overview report

9	WBL	Owner, hair & beauty business + training academy
	Vol	Team Leader, local branch of national charity
10	WBL	Manager of small WBL organisation working with 14 -16's.

Employers/sponsors yielded valuable information, including some evidence of impact of the PTLLS programmes attended by trainees on the organisation and the impact of the organisation on their training prospects and progress. This is a crucial area for further research. The impact of the reforms on teachers and learners is highly dependent upon the provider's management: the organisation's context, style, and culture as well as its strategic priorities, policies and workplace practices

Overview report: Conclusions, Recommendations, Issues and Areas for Research

1. Sector awareness, involvement and dissemination of information

There is a need for clear, reliable information about the new qualification requirements that is effectively disseminated through the most appropriate channels for the employer/sponsor.

The FE sector and the providers of ITT were found to be better informed about the 'Professionalisation agenda' than those from WBL/ACL or Voluntary sector.

The research indicates that where a local training providers association takes an active role in informing its members and working with the ITT programme providers, employer participation and engagement is much increased, and a demand for ITT can be generated.

Therefore national organisations and 'umbrella' bodies need appropriate strategies to ensure clear and consistent messages can be conveyed throughout their own sectors and localities.

Where there is good partnership working there has been a more positive engagement in the reform agenda. The Centres for Excellence in Initial Teacher Training seem to have an important role in brokering relationships within the lifelong learning sector and providing a framework for collaborative working. WMCETT has a particular brief to work with WBL, ACL, and voluntary sector provider associations and networks.

2. APA/EL

There is a need for more information about the accreditation of prior achievement, learning and experience and for more flexible delivery routes.

Some employer/sponsors assumed that every trainee must attend a PTLLS programme whether or not they have any teaching qualifications. Even if unqualified, many experienced trainees could have their prior learning and experience accredited and access the CTLLS or DTLLS as appropriate.

3. The status and 'use' of PTLLS

Research is required to examine the products designed and marketed by awarding bodies to explore:

- How far they meet the needs of new, existing and intending teachers in different parts of the lifelong learning sector.
- How far the range of products and practices that have evolved in the past year match up with the original intentions of LLUK/government.

Employers/sponsors and trainees in the WBL/ACL/Voluntary sector have seen PTLLS as a valuable introductory course in its own right. The original intention was that PTLLS, which does not have the status of a qualification, would be an 'induction' or 'taster' providing an entry point into the main qualifications. It is often used in this way in FE/HE provision but is being seen as a progression qualification by/for those in the wider sector.

4. Access to and progression through the full teaching qualification

Research is required to establish whether the wider sector needs smaller, stepped qualifications that might also incorporate the subject skill and the development of numeracy, literacy and IT to facilitate access and progression.

More work needs to be done on clarifying what constitutes an appropriate 'subject' qualification in some WBL/ACL/Voluntary sector contexts

Research is required to examine the time and cost implications for trainees wishing to qualify but who do not have any relevant qualification when starting PTLLS. Some trainees want to maximize their teaching potential by achieving DTLLS but do not have a level three vocational qualification or any qualifications in maths and English.

5. The 'full' and 'associate' teaching role

Confusion continues to exist about the differences between CTLLS and DTLLS and who should do which qualification. Some of the official literature is vague and can suggest that anyone operating in WBL would do CTLLS on the assumption that they would not be in the full teaching role.

Some trainees want to maximize their opportunities to work in different parts of the sector and therefore do not want to restrict their options by doing CTLLS. Others consider that they work in a narrow specialist field and do not need to do any teaching qualification beyond PTLLS. A structure of qualifications that allows for progression and staging might help to meet these needs.

6. The status and equivalence of ITT qualifications in the lifelong learning sector and schools.

Employers and trainees were unclear about the status of the qualifications and their equivalence with qualifications for teachers in schools. Some providers are working in partnership with schools and the lack of equivalence would appear to devalue the work of those partners in the lifelong learning sector.

7. IfL registration and the timeframe for completion

Summary of PTLLS Overview report

All staff in teaching roles are required to register with the IfL. Many did so on completion of PTLLS. However, they are required to obtain QTLS within five years. This may not be attainable for some trainees in full teaching roles working for small WBL/ACL providers where there are issues of cover, release and funding - especially where they also need to attain L2 literacy and numeracy and L3 subject qualifications.

8. The responsiveness of ITT providers to the needs of the sector as a whole

WBL/ACL/Voluntary sector providers find it difficult to locate good quality ITT provision that is responsive to the needs of the wider sector.

The study found that ITT providers in FE tend to be FE focused and teacher educators may lack the experience required to broaden the focus of the programme and/or address the needs of staff in the wider sector effectively. Inflexibility with regard to delivery patterns and locations may also be an issue.

Where there has been specific collaboration with the wider sector and courses have been designed to meet the identified needs of particular groups of staff such as those working with learners 14-16/19, or requiring particular patterns of delivery, high levels of satisfaction have been achieved.

This has implications for the CPD requirements of teacher educators and for curriculum design. A more responsive approach needs to be considered by providers of ITT in terms of programme content and delivery.

9. The experience of PTLLS

As different uses and applications of the PTLLS award have evolved, its original status and purpose has become less clear. In addition, its development to meet a variety of different needs has led to questions about the length of the programme and its ability to deliver meaningful outcomes within the time. In the context of high numbers of unqualified staff working in some parts of the sector, a longer, more in-depth programme may be attractive.

Some of the following points are related to the issue of the size of the programme, its length and the amount of funding that currently supports the award.

- **Initial assessment** was used on the case study programmes and it identified that a significant number of trainees have not attained the appropriate levels of skill in numeracy, literacy or both. This proved to be a dilemma for the teacher educators because they were unable to provide any support for learners when a significant need was identified. Moreover, the assumption that trainees outside FE could access basic skills support in college learning centres was not substantiated.

It may be appropriate to explore the need for a broader qualification that provides the development and accreditation of numeracy and literacy within it.

Summary of PTLLS Overview report

- **Work based observation** was seen as important by employers, trainees and teacher educators. It was a very effective means of informing staff and managers about the new qualification and CPD requirements. It appears to have had a high level of impact on smaller organisations especially and raised questions generally about how providers manage the quality of their own provision. However, the length of the PTLLS programme does not make workplace observation possible without additional funding.
- **Micro teaching** was considered an important learning activity but was seen as time consuming in the context of such a short programme.
- **One to one tutorial time** for the purpose of advice and guidance was considered important given the varied experience of the trainees, the lack of awareness in the wider sector and the need to guide them appropriately towards ATLS/QTLS. However, the funding related to PTLLS does not provide the time for this.

10. The impact of the programme

The PTLLS programme works well for new trainees but does not deliver the breadth and depth that is required by more experienced but unqualified staff. Trainees are introduced to general concepts in a superficial way on the programme but do not have the depth that is necessary to make a sustained impact on practice.

The main changes and improvements in practice appear to have arisen where the teacher educators modelled a wide variety of active, learner centred methods. This has important implications for the styles of delivery of PTLLS programmes

PTLLS+

- For example, a significant number of trainees identified that the PTLLS+ programme had had a profound impact on their skills.
- They particularly noted planning and the use of participative methods.
- The real, work based observation that is an integral part of PTLLS+ along with the progression tutorial were considered crucial by the employers/sponsors (who were prepared to extra for it)

11. Organisational impact

The research suggests that in smaller workplaces particularly, the teacher training programme had an impact which went beyond the practice of individual trainees, influencing the organisation more widely.

More research is required to examine the impact of training on the culture and practices of organisations, and also the impact of organisational culture and practices on the progress and achievement of the trainees employed.

12. Assessment

The assessment requirements of the PTLLS programme seem in some cases to be disproportionate to the size of the programme. For example, trainees identified 9 assignments in one and others indicated that twenty hours of

additional study was required. This may indicate that the programmes need to carry more credits where a greater the depth of assessment is required.

It could be argued that, as the original intention of PTLLS was to be an 'induction' into a qualifying programme, all the assessment within PTLLS should be diagnostic and formative in nature.

13. The capacity of employers to support the qualification and CPD needs of staff

This study suggests that the PTLLS programmes seem to have had most impact in the WBL/ACL/Voluntary sectors where the proportions of unqualified staff are highest and access to appropriate training is more problematic. Although significant and necessary for the delivery of government targets, organisations in the wider sector may lack the infrastructure and are not funded or supported in a way to make ITT provision easily accessible or sustainable.

14. Funding is required to support trainees in the wider lifelong learning sector in the professionalisation agenda is to be realised

Many employers/sponsors in the wider sector consider they are unable to support trainees to get the higher qualifications. Small organisations especially, find it difficult to release staff to attend training. Those interviewed in this study expressed considerable concern about the cost of release, cover, travel and the provision of extra support such as mentoring or help with basic skills for their staff. Although they expressed their commitment to the idea of the professionalisation agenda, many do not think they will be able to support their staff to gain CTLLS or DTLLS in work time. More work needs to be done on finding ways to support these organisations and the trainees within them.

15. Teacher educators

Teacher educators were considered to be professional, competent and very supportive. Employers and trainees were very complimentary about the knowledge, skills and abilities of the teacher educators. The main issue raised was the lack of knowledge and experience some teacher educators have of other areas within the lifelong learning sector. Teacher educators who work mainly in one part of the sector need to ensure that they gain real experience and understanding of the workings outside of this, in order to deliver a balanced programme at a time and place that meets the needs of all the participants. Teacher educators should undertake CPD and/or research activity into issues relating to WBL/ACL/Voluntary sectors.

Jill Hardman
August 2008